The Role of Transformative Education in Teaching Entrepreneurship in Fine Art in Tertiary Institutions in Nigeria

Muktar Ahmed
Department of Fine and Applied Arts,
Federal College of Education, Yola

Abstract: The 21st century seems to be challenging for individuals, groups, organisations, and governments in employment creation because they have to deal with constant change, globalization, increased competition, and continuous technological changes. The study examines the role of transformative education in teaching entrepreneurship in fine art in tertiary institutions in Nigeria. It adopted the two approaches to arts entrepreneurship education put forward by Beckman (2007): one focuses on teaching new venture creation and the other focuses on transitioning students to professional careers. And art entrepreneur as one who creates a new business by combining soft skills with hard skills in the face of risk and uncertainty for the purpose of achieving profit and growth. While, transformative education or learning is said to occur when individuals question assumptions based on prior experience and make changes in their thinking that lead to new worldviews, and new perspectives on their personal and professional life. The study employed survey design with mixed method approach (exploratory and inductive research approach) which enables collection and analyses of quantitative and qualitative data to provide indebt information on the issue being investigated. This approach is needed because there are hardly any empirical findings in tertiary institutions in Adamawa state, Nigeria. Data were analysed using quantitative and qualitative techniques. The results indicate transformative education has significant impact on entrepreneurship learning in fine art in tertiary institutions in Nigeria. The study concluded that the knowledge obtained from this study will contribute to an understanding of fine art teachers and students perspective transformations about the nature of 21st century entrepreneurship skills requirements through their personal identification with the transformative education.

Keywords: Entrepreneurship, Education, Transformative Education, Fine Art, Tertiary Institutions

INTRODUCTION
Social, economic and political change in recent years has also led to change within the education sector in globally (Neville & Brennan, 2015). Higher education has been challenged in its ability to remain relevant to the needs of students, society and the economy; and in its role to provide the research innovation and creativity that will support the technological challenges facing society that will take us into the 21st Century. The National Economic Development Agenda for Higher Education in the vision 20: 2020 emphasized the teaching of high quality entrepreneurship skills that will serve as the engine of Nigeria economic development. The document led to the review of the Nigerian National Policy on Education to emphasize entrepreneurship skills acquisition by institutions of learning from secondary to the universities to provide high-quality skills that is industry focused, employments generating and self-sustaining. It is also facilitate a level of performance and scale that will improve the learning experience and outcomes for students. Some of the key criteria for colleges of Education to achieve university status include campuses in different locations, updating and improvements in governance of the institutions, and an increase in the levels of performance and scale including international profile, research, funding and entrepreneurship, staff capacity and staff development. Therefore, complex change, greater connectivity, demands for flexible learning options, and a greater need for research innovation and creativity at a time of constrained resources define the context in which Federal college of Education Yola and other colleges of
education in general have to operate. Issues the colleges of Education sector in Nigeria face include their role and function within higher education, what it means to be a degree awarding institution, and the college of Education relevance and future role in the Nigeria economic development agenda. Organizational change in the shape of forced mergers and alliances with prescribed often politically driven outcomes call into question the fundamental values underpinning each college of education mission and vision of its future. The changing priorities at organizational level necessitate a committed and engaged teaching workforce for the successful inculcation of entrepreneurship skills of the 21st century (Rudaz, 2012; Breevaart, Bakker, Hetland, Demerouti, Olsen, & Espevik, 2014). Transformative Learning can help entrepreneurs in this challenge of adapting (Ciporen, 2010). In the process of Transformative Learning, individuals transform their frames of reference after an encounter with a critical event or disorienting dilemma to make them more applicable in a new situation (Mezirow, 2011). This transformation changes the way people understand themselves and their relationship with others and the world (Franz, 2010). After such a transformation of perspective, individuals are able to have adapted existing or new ways of thinking and doing, which they can apply in their actions (Dirkx & Mezirow, 2006; Isopahkala-Bouret, 2008; Howie & Bagnall, 2013). Thus, Transformative Learning (TL) has useful qualities and characteristics in the unique entrepreneurial development context as it makes entrepreneurs develop their ability to transform their frame of reference to adapt better to changing environments. There has been a lot of attention for the added value of TL in being skilled to adapt to new situations or to tackle challenges. This resulted in a lot of publications on this subject, but there is less information available about the triggers for TL: the events that stimulate and induce TL. To be able to support and stimulate TL, an identification of triggers of TL is needed.

This study had the goal to investigate those triggers in the context of the entrepreneur and to be able to advise coaches, trainers or organisers of incubator programs on how they can best stimulate TL. Guided by the assumptions on entrepreneurial development of Cope (2003) and utilizing the transformative learning theory from Mezirow (2011. In: Illeris, 2011), this study assessed the data for evidence of TL in the diaries of the entrepreneurs, examined the triggers behind these events and investigated the relationship between TL and the specific trigger. Based on the description above, the authors tried to solve the problem of low performance of entrepreneurial education among Fine Art graduates has been organized by examining the role of transformative education in teaching entrepreneurship in fine art in tertiary institutions in Nigeria.

Purpose of the study
The main purpose of this research is to investigate the Role of Transformative Education in Teaching Entrepreneurship in Fine Art in Tertiary Institutions in Nigeria. The specific objectives of this study:
1. To identify the component of Transformative Education needed for teaching of entrepreneurship in fine Art
2. To determine the influence of Transformative Education on Teaching Entrepreneurship in Fine Art in Tertiary Institutions in Nigeria

**Research Questions**
1. What are the components of Transformative Education needed for teaching of entrepreneurship in fine Art?
2. What is the influence of Transformative Education on Teaching Entrepreneurship in Fine Art in Tertiary Institutions in Nigeria?

**Research hypothesis**

\[ H_0: \text{Transformative Education have no significant effect on the Teaching Entrepreneurship in Fine Art in Tertiary Institutions in Nigeria.} \]

**Theoretical Framework: Social marginality Theory**

This study was guided by Social Marginality theory as explained by White (2013). The theory suggests that individuals who perceive a strong level of incongruence between their personal attributes and the role they hold in society will be motivated to change or reconstruct their social reality. While some people may reconstruct their reality by changing careers or employers, others may choose self-employment. ‘Marginal men” are referred as individuals who are less integrated in their society. Since marginal men are not completely part of the society of their adoption, they are free of the restrictions imposed by its value system (White, 2013). At the same time, having left their own society, they are no longer constrained by its dominant values. This situation gives way to the development of unconventional patterns of behavior, which increases their propensity to become entrepreneurs.

Observations/Criticism: It has been criticized according to White (2013) that being marginal is not sufficient explanation for the over-representation of certain people in entrepreneurship carriers e.g. Hispanics and Africans are underrepresented in entrepreneurship despite them being marginal. Aggressiveness and co-operation is among things in which marginal people tend to have. The social marginality theory finds application in this study for its ability to see entrepreneurship learning as a means to generate employment by the unemployed nd as a means of poverty reduction among low income group.

**Entrepreneur and Entrepreneurship**

According to Kenton (2019) an entrepreneur is an individual who, rather than working as an employee, founds and runs a small business, assuming all the risks and rewards of the venture. The entrepreneur is commonly seen as an innovator, a source of new ideas, goods, services and business/or procedures. Entrepreneurs play a key role in any economy particularly in developing economies like Nigeria. This is because entrepreneurs are the people who have the skills and initiative necessary to anticipate current and future needs and bring good new ideas to market. Entrepreneurs who prove to be successful in taking on
the risks of a startup are rewarded with profits, fame and continued growth opportunities. Those who fail suffer losses and become less prevalent in the markets (Kenton, 2019). Entrepreneurship is essential for community, especially in the lower layer (the grass-root level), in the framework of the process of empowerment (empowering process) community in the economic field related to social, political, and so forth. According to economists, entrepreneurs are people who combine the factors of production such as natural resources, labor, materials, and other equipment to enhance the value higher than the previous.

Entrepreneurship requires three basic competencies, namely (1) entrepreneurial (business), (2) capable of managing and (3) have the capability to cultivated entrepreneurial fields. Entrepreneurial spirit can be formed through a process of acculturation that are integrated in the learning. Entrepreneurs generally have the same properties, namely those 'who have the energy, the desire to engage in innovative adventure, a willingness to accept personal responsibility in creating an event in the manner they choose, and the desire to achieve a very high, optimistic attitude and strong optimism for the future. Entrepreneur according Zimmerer & Schorborough (1998) is '. art entrepreneur is one 'who creates a new business by combining soft skills with hard skills in the face of risk and uncertainty for the purpose of achieving profit and growth by identifying opportunities and assembling the necessary resources to capitalize on them " Entrepreneurs are people who are able to combine the soft skills with hard skills. Fine Art skills of painting or carving are part of life skills which can make the artist self-reliant and economically independent. Training in painting not only provide a job, but can be directed at the development of painting as cultural treasures that are able to be a source of business.

Transformative Education
Transformative learning adopted from the philosophy of humanism which gives outstanding appreciation on human values without exception. This philosophy emphasizes human resources as the vicegerent messenger primacausa on earth, which in addition has the potential, disposition to develop themselves (self-directed learning) as well as with others to develop themselves and provide benefits in the universe, including in glorifying the Creator (Olim & Bertha, 2015). Concepts which successfully raised by a number of experts (Olim & Bertha, 2015; Knowles, 2005) able to principles that need to be promoted, namely:

1. There is a progression from dependence on the ability to be independence;
2. Adults had a very rewarding experience to be applied in the learning
3. More emphasis on problem solving and life task
4. Education and learning addressed in an effort to improve life competence
5. Learning is based on a clear rationale and objectives and
6. The main driving factors and most needed in learning is an internal motivation as well as self-esteem. The implications of the principles according to Knowles (2005) consists of two meanings, the first of the cognitive theory of adults have some knowledge of good and bad values and implications on both the nature of the support or resistance learning process. Second, as (1) a strong ingredient in achieving goals both for participants to learn and the
tutors (2) adults need direct experience and practice activities (3) learning based on awareness and (4) has a full self-awareness both positive and negative. There are two important things Knowles (2005) argued that there are certain principles that are very dominant and that will continue to be dominant in subsequent theoretical explanation that will transform educators or facilitators mental models and learning principles into transformative learning. The task of educators is to give an example as well as to facilitate learning through real function; these include but not limited to:

1. Creating supportive learning environment including the encouragement,
2. To help learners clarify the purpose of learning and set targets,
3. To provide convenience for learners to learn to be able to realize their objectives,
4. Provide infrastructure support for learning entrepreneurship;
5. Making himself as a learning resource,
6. To accept and develop personal and group conditions,
7. Being a partner in the study, members of the group and give the best advice to increase individual and group progress,
8. Being a snitch for any learning problems,
9. Providing services related to feelings in the learning process as in resolving conflict and motivation (Knowles, 2005).

Knowles (2005) further noted that the entrepreneurial life skills are an integral part of 21st century learning.

**METHODOLOGY**

The study utilized descriptive survey design and mixed methods approach which consist of both quantitative and qualitative techniques with two main instruments used in data collection. The study adopted a descriptive survey research design because it involves seeking the opinions of primary school female teachers, head teachers on the impact of their retention on quality of education at the primary levels. The population comprises of all the teachers and students of the school of vocation, Federal College of Education, Yola in Adamawa State. Ten teachers and 90 students were randomly sampled for the study which gives a total of 100 sample. The instrument used for data collection was a questionnaire developed by the researchers, titled; Transformative Education and Teaching Entrepreneurship Teaching in Fine Art Questionnaire (TEETFAQ) and Interview Guide divided into two sections, A and B. section A is based on four point Likert scale of Strongly Agree (SA), Agree (A), Strongly Disagree (AD) and Disagree (D) and section B is based on yes or no response style. The instrument was validated by three (3) Ph.D holders which were senior lecturers from School of Vocational Education Federal College of Education, Yola. Their recommendation on the areas of content and appropriateness of the language and the instrument was corrected before utilisation for this study. Interview was conducted among teachers and students of fine art department using a guide. The guide contained five open-ended questions.

**Data analysis:** Mean and standard deviation was used for analyzing the data obtained from this study to answer the research questions. While chi-square test of goodness of fit
was used to test the hypotheses with statistical software, Epi info, and thematic analysis was used to analyse the interview response. The analysis was done concurrently on the basis of the research questions which were stated for the study.

RESULTS
Data collected were analysed using descriptive statistics of mean, standard deviation and chi-square goodness of fit-test. The findings are presented below:

Research Question 1: What is the influence of Transformative Education on Teaching Entrepreneurship in Fine Art in Tertiary Institutions in Nigeria?

Table I: Mean and Standard Deviation Responses on Transformative Education and Teaching Entrepreneurship in Fine Art in Tertiary Institutions in Nigeria

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Items</th>
<th>SA Fx (%)</th>
<th>A Fx (%)</th>
<th>D Fx (%)</th>
<th>SD Fx (%)</th>
<th>Av g</th>
<th>Std. De v</th>
<th>Re m</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Low level of educational background</td>
<td>4 [3%]</td>
<td>45 [36%]</td>
<td>56 [45%]</td>
<td>20 [16%]</td>
<td>2.26</td>
<td>1.62 D</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of awareness of entrepreneurship</td>
<td>43 [34%]</td>
<td>65 [52%]</td>
<td>11 [9%]</td>
<td>6 [5%]</td>
<td>3.16</td>
<td>0.66 A</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not seek entrepreneurial training</td>
<td>67 [54%]</td>
<td>34 [27%]</td>
<td>14 [11%]</td>
<td>10 [8%]</td>
<td>3.26</td>
<td>4.34 A</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Infrequent seminar and workshop attendance</td>
<td>15 [12%]</td>
<td>79 [63%]</td>
<td>23 [18%]</td>
<td>8 [6%]</td>
<td>2.81</td>
<td>0.85 A</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Low involvement in entrepreneurial activities</td>
<td>26 [21%]</td>
<td>59 [47%]</td>
<td>28 [22%]</td>
<td></td>
<td>2.79</td>
<td>1.98 A</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inactive entrepreneurship curriculum</td>
<td>33 [26%]</td>
<td>67 [54%]</td>
<td>16 [13%]</td>
<td>9 [7%]</td>
<td>2.99</td>
<td>0.65 A</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The results on Table 2 revealed the respondents perception about influence of transformative education on entrepreneurship learning in Fine Art. The results showed that most sampled respondents (45%) disagreed that low level of education was responsible (average = 2.62). However, 52% of sampled respondents expressed that their colleagues are slow in acquiring entrepreneurship skills due to lack of awareness (average = 3.16). Likewise, 54% of respondents showed that the respondents do not mostly seek entrepreneurship training. Their level of participation in the seminar and workshop on entrepreneurship is not frequent. This fact was expressed by 63% of respondents (average = 2.81). Likewise, 47% of respondents expressed they were not always involved in involved in entrepreneurship activities (average = 2.79). Above all, 54% of respondents expressed that students and teachers’ inactive entrepreneurship curriculum was responsible for their low participation (average 2.99).

Ho, Transformative Education has no significant effect on the Teaching Entrepreneurship in Fine Art in Tertiary Institutions in Nigeria
Table 3: shows the Chi-Square Tests scores of Transformative Education and Entrepreneurship in Fine Art

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Value</th>
<th>Df</th>
<th>Asymp. Sig. (2-sided)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pearson Chi-Square</td>
<td>10.814</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>.029</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Likelihood Ratio</td>
<td>10.331</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>.035</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Linear-by-Linear Association</td>
<td>.614</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>.433</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N of Valid Cases</td>
<td>125</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The results of chi-square analysis show chi-square value 10.814 at degree of freedom of 4, p-value (.029) < 0.05. Therefore, this result established a significant influence of Transformative Education on Entrepreneurship skills learning in Fine Art and therefore, quality of education, employment creation and economic self-reliance. This means that the null hypothesis stated is rejected and the alternative hypothesis is accepted.

Qualitative Analysis

On the interview, majority of respondents were of the view that, low level of education background of the students and teachers on entrepreneurship skills in Fine Art is a major hindrance in impacting the quality of their teaching and learning. That entrepreneurship education particularly, at the primary and secondary school levels in neglected. This was because majority of the students and teachers in the primary and secondary schools had only the National Certificate in Education (NCE) as their highest educational qualification, the respondents argued. Similarly, majority of the interviewees agreed that, lack of awareness in acquiring entrepreneurship skills is affecting their learning of entrepreneurship skills and need a transformed awareness education. Again, lack of regular seminar and conference attendance among the teachers is also contributing to low quality teaching of entrepreneurship because it does not enable them update their knowledge and skills regularly. This also has negative effect on the quality of education delivery. Therefore, the major opinion of the interviewees is that, teachers’ qualification has significant impact on entrepreneurship skills learning and quality of education. In another development, low involvement in entrepreneurship activities and research as indicated by most of the interviewees' impacts entrepreneurship teaching quality in Fine Art negatively. In fact, one of the interviewees (Teacher) said; “How can we participate actively in research and entrepreneurship training activities on low motivation and lack of facilities? For some time now we have not received any training facilities in the department, how can we train the students?” (Personal communication, 19/03/2019). Majority of the interviewees' also indicated inactive participation of students and teachers in academic activities such as quiz, debates and projects due to low level of motivation and poor conditions of service. These findings agree with results of other studies: Akinbote (2007) observed that, the quality of education has not kept abreast of the expansion in enrolment. Although, this according to UNESCO (2001) continues to be a global concern, yet it is the general belief that the competence of teachers in entrepreneurship is central to the education of children.
In a way, what constitutes competence in teaching is intimately connected with the type of entrepreneurship education programmes available for preparing students for life. Therefore it can be argued that, one of the problems of entrepreneurship education in Nigeria is the poor quality of teachers produced from the Teachers’ Colleges with little or no training in entrepreneurship. Akinbote (2000) has attributed the poor quality of entrepreneurship skills training in the Teachers Colleges among other things to the quality of students admitted into the colleges and the quality of teachers. However, the lowering of the admission requirements into the colleges for whatever reasons, has not only affected the quality of the products of the colleges but also the ability of the products to acquire entrepreneurship skills in addition to image and prestige of the teaching profession (Akinbote, 1999). This observation agrees with the assertion of Liberman cited in Akinbote (1999) that the quality of the entry qualifications of recruits into a profession is bound to affect not only their efficiency and effectiveness but also the prestige of the profession.

SUMMARY OF MAJOR FINDINGS

Based on data analysis, the major findings of this study can be summarized as follows: Teachers’ qualification and awareness has significant impact on entrepreneurship skills learning through transformed education that facilitates the acquisition of life skills among learners; Teachers and students low involvement in entrepreneurship activities has significant impact on the quality of education; and Lack of seminar, conference and workshop attendance affects teachers’ entrepreneurship skill delivery.

DISCUSSION OF FINDINGS

The result indicates that there is significant impact of teachers’ qualification on quality of entrepreneurship education and a significant influence of teacher awareness on quality of entrepreneurship education provided to learners. Similar observation was made by Adeleke (2007) as cited in Ahmadi and Lukman (2015: 33), education sector in Nigeria, particularly its quality has suffered the plight of inadequate instructional resources, inadequate qualified teachers, poor funding syndrome, low female enrolment, inadequate teacher preparation, and lack of motivation among others. These can have negative effects on entrepreneurship skills training. Similarly, Wachiuri (2015: 231) in another study on the problems and prospects of teacher education: a review, observed that, the problem of getting sufficient numbers of qualified teachers to staff school classrooms is one of the most significant public policy issues facing many countries. The study added that, in most African countries including Nigeria, the quality of teacher education has been questioned because of their inability to equip the learners with appropriate life skills through entrepreneurship training. It further stated that, it can be safely stated that, teacher education has reached a level of where the problem is not that of quantity but that of quality. Therefore, it needs to be transformed to provide for effective entrepreneurship skills learning. This finding has been supported by many other studies (Akinbote, 2007; Akindutire and Ekundayo, 2012; and Akinduyo, 2014).
CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS

The validity of any education system depends on the quality of teaching and the availability of competent teachers. The issue of poor education standards or quality is compounded in Nigeria because of the political, economic, social and cultural syndromes of underdevelopment. At present, the government and private education sector in the country is more interested in achieving quantitative expansion of schools and higher institutions at the expense of good quality teachers, lecturers, adequate physical planning and equipment. The Nigerian teacher education programme must break new grounds in the area of making it a model, attractive and more equitable for females and males. If the programme is effectively launched, implemented and managed, it may bring about a measurable positive change that will attract both new entrants and experienced female teachers to be retained in the profession and enhance quality education which is the bedrock for national development. Therefore, it is hoped that effective management of entrepreneurship education through provision of funds, equity, enforcement of relevant legislations, redistribution of teaching resources among schools, and re-training will not only improve the quality of entrepreneurship education delivery and consolidate the educational system; but that the entrepreneurial curriculum for the Nigerian schools will be effectively and efficiently implemented towards the fulfillment of educational goals and objectives. In view of the above, it is therefore recommended that:

Review of teacher education curriculum; the current theory dominated teacher education curriculum needs to be reviewed so as to incorporate entrepreneurship content; Regular training and re-training of teachers to equip them with relevant skills and competencies that can enhance their quality, and life skill delivery; Adequate motivation of teachers through regular payment of salaries, allowances, good conditions of work and provision of in-service training to equip them with entrepreneurship skills; Educational institutions, including the Colleges Education and other activities organized by the tertiary institutions, should utilize the norms required in entrepreneurship education which generally takes place in the family and society

REFERENCES


